Supreme Court, U.S.
FILED
JAN 14 2006
OFFICE OF THE CLERK

No. 05- 05-879

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

ADELLA CHIMINYA TACHIONA, ON HER OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HER LATE HUSBAND TAPFUMA CHIMINYA TACHIONA, EFRIDAH PFEBVE, ON HER OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HER LATE BROTHER METTHEW PFEBVE, ELLIOT PFEBVE, ON HIS OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HIS BROTHER METTHEW PFEBVE, EVELYN MASAITI, ON HER OWN BEHALF, MARIA DEL CARMEN STEVENS, ON HER OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HER LATE HUSBAND DAVID YENDALL STEVENS,

Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Respondent.

Petition for a Writ of Certiorari to the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI

PAUL B. SWEENEY
HOGAN & HARTSON L.L.P.
875 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022
(212) 918-3000

WILLIAM J. BOWMAN*
CHRISTOPHER T. HANDMAN
MARY ELLEN CALLAHAN
JESSICA L. ELLSWORTH
HOGAN & HARTSON L.L.P.
555 Thirteenth Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004
(202) 637-5600

* Counsel of Record

Counsel for Petitioners

Additional Counsel for Petitioners on Inside Cover

WILSON-EPES PRINTING CO., INC. – (202) 789-0096 – WASHINGTON, D. C. 20001

ARMANDO ROSQUETE
NATALIE BAREFOOT
HOGAN & HARTSON L.L.P.
Mellon Financial Center
1111 Brickell Avenue
Suite 1900
Miami, FL 33131
(305) 459-6500

HAMISH P.M. HUME
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER L.L.P.
5301 Wisconsin Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20015
(202) 237-2727

QUESTIONS PRESENTED

1. Whether the Second Circuit correctly held—in conflict with precedent from this Court and other courts of appeals—that the United States government had standing to appeal a final judgment that did not bind the government and where the government's interest was in a procedural ruling on which the judgment was based, not in the judgment itself?

2. Whether the Second Circuit correctly interpreted the scope of immunity provided under the Convention on Privileges and Immunities of the United Nations when the court ignored the plain language of the treaty, its structure, and its specificity—contrary to this Court's precedents on proper treaty interpretation?

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
QUESTIONS PRESENTED	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	v
OPINIONS BELOW	2
JURISDICTION	2
STATUTORY PROVISIONS INVOLVED	2
INTRODUCTION	2
STATEMENT OF THE CASE	3
A. District Court Proceedings	4
B. Court Of Appeals Proceedings	8
REASONS FOR GRANTING THE WRIT	11
I. THE SECOND CIRCUIT'S STANDING DECISION CONFLICTS WITH THIS COURT'S PRECEDENTS ON AN IMPORTANT AND RECURRING QUESTION OF FEDERAL JURISDICTION	11
A. The Second Circuit's Acceptance Of The Government's Proffered Interests As Sufficient For Standing Conflicts With This Court's Precedent	12
B. The Government's Only Remaining Injury Is Its Interest In Reversing Unfavorable Precedent, Which This Court Has Held To Be Insufficient To Confer Standing To Appeal	16

TABLE OF CONTENTS—Continued

Page

II. THE SECOND CIRCUIT'S INTERPRETATION OF THE U.N. CONVENTION CONFLICTS WITH THIS COURT'S DECISIONS ON AN IMPORTANT AND RECURRING ISSUE OF INTERNATIONAL LAW 19

A. The Decision Below Fails To Uphold The U.N. Convention's Plain Meaning And Ignores Applicable Principles Of Statutory Interpretation 19

B. The Decision Below Is An Unwarranted Expansion Of Diplomatic Immunity For Temporary Representatives To The United Nations 25

C. The Second Circuit's Interpretation Of "Inviolability" Conflicts With This Court's Decisions 26

CONCLUSION 29

APPENDICES

Appendix A: Opinion of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, dated Oct. 6, 2004 ..... 1a

Appendix B: Decision and Order of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, filed Dec. 12, 2002 ..... 29a

Appendix C: Decision and Order of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, dated Feb. 14, 2002 ..... 97a

TABLE OF CONTENTS—Continued

		Page
Appendix D:	Decision and Order of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, dated Oct. 30, 2001	121a
Appendix E:	Order of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit denying rehearing, dated Aug. 30, 2005	217a
Appendix F:	Letter from Clerk of the Supreme Court of the United States, dated Nov. 18, 2005	219a
Appendix G:	Pertinent Statutory Provisions	221a

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

CASES:

767 Third Ave. Assocs. v. *Permanent Mission of Zaire*, 988 F.2d 285 (2d Cir. 1993) 28

Air France v. *Saks*, 470 U.S. 392 (1985) 22

Arizonans for Official English v. *Arizona*, 520 U.S. 43 (1997) 9, 11

Boston Tow Boat Co. v. *United States*, 321 U.S. 632 (1944) 9, 16, 17, 18, 19

Breard v. *Greene*, 523 U.S. 371 (2001) 28

Chan v. *Korean Air Lines, Ltd.*, 490 U.S. 122 (1989) 13, 20, 22, 26

Duncan v. *Walker*, 533 U.S. 167 (2001) 22

Edward Hines Yellow Pine Trs. v. *United States*, 263 U.S. 143 (1923) 9

Green v. *Biddle*, 21 U.S. (8 Wheat.) 1 (1821) 20

Harrison v. *PPG Indus., Inc.*, 446 U.S. 578 (1980) 23

HCSC-Laundry v. *United States*, 450 U.S. 1 (1981) 23

Hellenic Lines, Ltd. v. *Moore*, 345 F.2d 978 (D.C. Cir. 1965) 25, 28

Henderson v. *United States*, 517 U.S. 654 (1996) 27

In re Paschen, 296 F.3d 1203 (11th Cir. 2002) 23

In re The Amiable Isabella, 19 U.S. (6 Wheat.) 1 (1821) 20

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—Continued

Page

Johnson v. *Browne*, 205 U.S. 309 (1907) 13

Kolovrant v. *Oregon*, 366 U.S. 187 (1961)..... 13

Korczak v. *Sedeman*, 427 F.3d 419 (7th Cir. 2005)..... 17

Lynchburg Gas Co. v. *Federal Power Comm'n*, 284 F.2d 756 (3d Cir. 1960)..... 17

Marbury v. *Madison*, 5 U.S. (1 Cranch) 137 (1803).... 13

Medellin v. *Dretke*, 125 S. Ct. 2088 (2005) 20, 22

Perkins v. *Elg*, 307 U.S. 325 (1939) 13

Raines v. *Byrd*, 521 U.S. 811 (1997)..... 14, 15, 16

Reid v. *Covert*, 354 U.S. 1 (1957)..... 28

Ruotolo v. *Ruotolo*, 572 F.2d 336 (1st Cir. 1978)..... 17

Shaff v. *United States* 695 F.2d 1138 (9th Cir. 1983)..... 17

Sepulveda v. *United States*, 330 F.3d 55 (1st Cir. 2003) 23

Silveira v. *Lockyer*, 312 F.3d 1052 (9th Cir. 2003)..... 23

South Dakota v. *Yankton Sioux Tribe*, 522 U.S. 329 (1998) 23

Sumitomo Shoji America, Inc. v. *Avagliano*, 457 U.S. 176 (1982) 13, 20, 22, 24

TRW Inc. v. *Andrews*, 534 U.S. 19 (2001) 22

United States v. *Alvarez-Machain*, 504 U.S. 655 (1992) 22

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—Continued

Page

United States v. *Stuart*, 489 U.S. 353 (1989) 20

Valentine v. *United States ex rel. Neidecker*, 299 U.S. 5 (1936) 22

Varity Corp. v. *Howe*, 516 U.S. 489 (1996) 23

Verlinden B.V. v. *Central Bank of Nigeria*, 461 U.S. 480 (1983) 19

Wiwa v. *Royal Dutch Petroleum Co.*, 226 F.3d 88 (2d Cir. 2000) 25

CONSTITUTION:

U.S. Const. art. VI, § 1, cl. 2 13

STATUTES:

22 U.S.C. §§ 254 *et seq.* 26

28 U.S.C. § 517 5

28 U.S.C. § 1254(1) 2

28 U.S.C. § 1350 4

28 U.S.C. § 1350 note, Pub. L. No. 102-256, 106 Stat. 73 (1992) 4

28 U.S.C. § 2403 17

Zimbabwe Democracy Act of 2000, S. 2677, 106th Cong. (2000) 5

LEGISLATIVE MATERIALS:

S. Rep. No. 102-249 (1991) 28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—Continued

Page

Torture Victim Act of 1989: Hearing No. 101-1284 Before Subcomm. on Immigration & Refugee Affairs of the S. Comm. on the Judiciary, 101st Cong. (1990) 28

RULES:

S. Ct. Rule 10(a) 12

S. Ct. Rule 10(c) 12

Fed. R. Civ. P. 24 7

TREATIES:

Convention on Privileges and Immunities of the United Nations, *adopted* Feb. 13, 1946, *United States accession*, April 29, 1970, 21 U.S.T. 1418 (1970) 5

U.N. Convention, art. IV, § 11 ..... *passim*

U.N. Convention, art. IV, § 11(a) ..... *passim*

U.N. Convention, art. IV, § 11(g) ..... *passim*

U.N. Convention, art. IV, § 14 27

U.N. Convention, art. V, § 19 ..... 23, 24

Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, *adopted* Apr. 18, 1961, *United States accession*, Dec. 13, 1972, 23 U.S.T. 3227 (1972) 5

Vienna Convention, art. 4(1) 26

Vienna Convention, art. 9(1) 26

Vienna Convention, art. 22 28

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—Continued

Page

Vienna Convention, art. 29 ..... 6, 10, 11, 21, 24

Vienna Convention, art. 31 ..... 10, 21, 24

Vienna Convention, art. 36 20

OTHER AUTHORITIES:

15A Charles Alan Wright, *et al.*, *Federal Practice and Procedure* § 3902 (2d ed. 1992) 11

Brief for the United States in *United States Dep't of Commerce* v. *United States House of Representatives*, No. 98-404 (Oct. 5, 1998) 16

James Lamont, *Mugabe Defies Ban to Seek Food Summit Aid*, Fin. Times, June 9, 2002 26

Restatement (Second) of Foreign Relations § 75(1) (1965) 24-25

Restatement (Second) of Foreign Relations § 80(2) (1965) 24-25

United States Department of State Country Reports on Human Rights Practices, Zimbabwe, 2000 (Feb. 23, 2001), available at http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2000/af/852.htm 3

United States Department of State Country Reports on Human Rights Practices, Zimbabwe, 2004 (Feb. 28, 2005), available at http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2004/41634.htm 3

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

No. 05-___

ADELLA CHIMINYA TACHIONA, ON HER OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HER LATE HUSBAND TAPFUMA CHIMINYA TACHIONA, EFRIDAH PFEBVE, ON HER OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HER LATE BROTHER METTHEW PFEBVE, ELLIOT PFEBVE, ON HIS OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HIS BROTHER METTHEW PFEBVE, EVELYN MASAITI, ON HER OWN BEHALF, MARIA DEL CARMEN STEVENS, ON HER OWN BEHALF AND ON BEHALF OF HER LATE HUSBAND DAVID YENDALL STEVENS,

Petitioners,

v.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Respondent.

Petition for a Writ of Certiorari to the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI

Petitioners respectfully petition this Court for a writ of certiorari to review the judgment of the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit in this case.[1]

[1] For purposes of recusal, counsel for petitioners states that Hogan & Hartson L.L.P. began representing petitioners in this matter in April 2001.